INFORMATION SHARING PROTOCOL BETWEEN THE SCOTTISH CHILDREN'S REPORTER ADMINISTRATION AND THE CROWN OFFICE AND PROCURATOR FISCAL SERVICE





INTRODUCTION

1. This Protocol has been agreed between the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service (COPFS) and the Scottish Children's Reporter Administration (SCRA).

2. It sets out the guidance which must be followed in any request for information between SCRA and COPFS and to enable decisions to be taken at a local level, where possible. Before information is shared by either party, they must be satisfied that the information requested falls within the terms of this protocol. Any difficulties with the operation of this protocol which cannot be resolved at a local level or are considered to have implications for national practice should be referred to the Crown Office Policy Division and/or the SCRA Head of Practice and Policy.

ROLE OF SCRA, THE PRINCIPAL REPORTER AND THE CHILDREN'S HEARINGS SYSTEM

3. SCRA is a national body focused on children most at risk. SCRA was formed under the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1994 and was preserved under the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011 ("the 2011 Act"). Their main responsibilities are:

- to assist and facilitate the work of the Principal Reporter
- to deploy and manage staff to carry out that work; and
- to provide suitable accommodation for Children's Hearings

4. The Principal Reporter exercises professional functions in respect of the children's reporter service, matters relating to the referral of children to hearings, organising hearings and responding to appeals before the Sheriff. The functions of the Principal Reporter can be delegated to authorised employees of SCRA and it is this that allows Reporters to act in the name of the Principal Reporter across Scotland.

5. The principal purpose of proceedings in the Children's Hearings System (both in a children's hearing and related court proceedings) is to ascertain what measures of compulsory supervision are necessary in the interests of the child¹. A central element is the participation of the child, his/her parents and any other adults involved in the child's life ('relevant persons').²

6. Children's Hearings are conducted in private, with only certain persons (including the child, and 'relevant persons') having a right to attend. Other persons (including professionals working with the family) may be admitted to the hearing at the discretion of the chairing member.

¹ For example, in the case of W v Kennedy 1988 SLT 583, the Inner House of the Court of Session said that "proceedings in front of the sheriff on referral are self contained civil proceedings sui generis in which is must be borne in mind at all times that the principal purpose is to ascertain what is necessary to be done in the interests of the child".

² As defined in sections 81(3) and 200 of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011

7. Section 179 of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011 states that in particular circumstances, the Principal Reporter must provide certain information to COPFS.

8. Section 172 of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011 provides a statutory framework for the provision of evidence by the Procurator Fiscal to the Principal Reporter. Section 172(4) of the 2011 Act allows for the prosecutor to refuse to provide the Principal Reporter with the information if it is necessary to retain the evidence for the purposes of any proceedings in respect of a crime, whether the proceedings have been, or are still to be, commenced.

PROVISION OF INFORMATION FROM SCRA TO COPFS

9. This is governed by section 179 of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011.

Section 179

- (1) This section applies where:
- (a) by virtue of this Act, the Principal Reporter, a children's hearing or the sheriff has determined, is determining or is to determine any matter relating to a child,
- (b) criminal proceedings have been commenced against an accused,
- (c) the proceedings have not yet been concluded, and
- (d) the child is connected in any way with the circumstances that gave rise to the proceedings, the accused or any other person connected in any way with those circumstances.

(2) The Principal Reporter must make available to the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service any information held by the Principal Reporter relating to the prosecution which the Service requests for the purpose of -

- (a) the prevention or detection of crime, or
- (b) the apprehension or prosecution of offenders

Paragraphs 10 - 29 provide further information on the provisions of section 179.

"The Principal Reporter, a children's hearing or the sheriff has determined, is determining or is to determine any matter relating to a child"

- 10. The matters which may be determined include:
 - (i) Proceedings in relation to Child Assessment Orders and Child Protection Orders under Part 5
 - (ii) Investigation and Referral to a Children's Hearing by the Principal Reporter under Part 6

- (iii) Pre-hearing Panel determinations under Part 8
- (iv) Determinations of Children's Hearings under Parts 9, 11, 12 and 13
- (v) Proceedings before a Sheriff under Part 10
- (vi) Appeals under Part 15.

The matters which may be determined can include past situations (including proceedings under the Children (Scotland) Act 1995), for example where the sheriff found the grounds for referral not to be established and the child is not subject to any order.

"Criminal proceedings have been commenced against an accused"

11. Criminal proceedings can relate to both summary and solemn prosecutions.

12. Summary proceedings will normally commence on the date of the recording of the plea from the accused. There is no requirement for the service of the complaint or citation, provided that a plea is entered on behalf of the accused.³

13. In cases where an initiating warrant is obtained under section 136 of the Criminal Procedure (Scotland) Act 1995, proceedings are deemed to have commenced on the date the warrant to apprehend or to cite the accused is granted, provided the warrant is executed without undue delay.

14. Solemn proceedings normally commence on the date of whichever of the following happens first:

- (i) the grant of the petition warrant to arrest and commit the accused;
- (ii) the intimation of a petition; or
- (iii) service of an indictment

"The proceedings have not yet been concluded"

15. Proceedings will be deemed to be concluded on any of the following events:

- (i) a plea of guilty is recorded against the accused;
- (ii) the accused is acquitted and all appeals are exhausted;
- (iii) the proceedings against the accused are deserted simpliciter;
- (iv) the accused is convicted and all appeals are exhausted;
- (v) the proceedings are deserted pro loco et tempore for any reason and no further trial diet is appointed; or

 $^{^3}$ Chilcott v McGowan 2012 S.C.L. 372. This is the case, even in situations where the plea is subsequently withdrawn

(vi) the indictment or the complaint falls or is for any other reason not brought to trial, the diet is not continued, adjourned or postponed and no further proceedings are in contemplation

"The child is connected in any way with the circumstances that gave rise to the proceedings, the accused or any other person connected with those circumstances"

16. This is a broad provision and will include situations where the child is a witness in any criminal prosecution. It will also cover situations where the child is not a witness, but is otherwise connected to the circumstances which give rise to the prosecution. This will include situations where the child was involved in the commission of the offence, including when they are an accused.

17. The provision will also apply where the child is not a witness, nor connected to the circumstances of the case, but is connected to the accused or any other person involved in the case (including any other person on the list of witnesses). This is not restricted to situations where the child is related to the accused or other person.

"Any information held by the Principal Reporter"

18. Section 179(2) of the 2011 applies to information that is held by the Principal Reporter. The Principal Reporter holds information about a child that relates to the investigation of the referral of the child, any children's hearing for the child and any proof and appeal proceedings in relation to the child.

19. Although records of proceedings of a children's hearing are made, these only record basic details about who attended, the responses to the statement of grounds, the purpose of the hearing and the hearing's decision – these are not formal minutes of the hearing. Proof proceedings are similar to summary criminal procedure in nature and are only recorded and transcribed in very limited circumstances. Furthermore, case information will normally be destroyed when the child reaches 18 years old.

20. Some of the information held by the Principal Reporter may relate to the prosecution of an individual. Examples of such information include:

- information about particular vulnerabilities of a witness;
- details of expert witnesses who have provided reports obtained by the reporter during the investigation of the referral, a children's hearing or proof proceedings;
- lines of argument used by agents acting for the relevant person, where that person is also the accused in related criminal proceedings;
- a precognition of a child witness;
- information about any significant events relating to evidence in the proof proceedings where the evidence was provided by COPFS in terms of

 information about the relevant person in the event of a prosecution under section 73(4) of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011 – failure to attend at a hearing.

This is not an exhaustive list.

"For the purpose of the prevention or detection of crime, or the apprehension or prosecution of offenders"

When will the Reporter routinely provide the information requested?

21. Although section 179 provides a duty on the Principal Reporter to provide information to COPFS in these circumstances, there is the danger that if evidence of what has occurred during the proceedings under the 2011 Act is to be routinely made available and used in subsequent prosecutions, then there will be significant implications for the participation of the child, his/her parents and other relevant persons. The information available to Children's Hearings and the quality of the families' engagement with the process may be affected, resulting in a less effective outcome for the child.

22. Therefore, before any information is provided under this protocol, it must be established why the information is being requested. In every request for information the prosecutor should clearly specify:

- the type of information being sought (e.g. witness statement of 'X', details of the expert who provided a report on the child 'Y' etc.);
- the reason(s) why the information is being sought, including reference to how it will assist in the prevention or detection of crime or the apprehension or prosecution of offenders; and
- whether there are any implications for the rights of the child or others under the European Convention of Human Rights (for example, the right to respect for private and family life under Article 8); and
- why the provision of information is necessary in the public interest.

A style form for the request of such information is attached at Annex A.

23. It is envisaged that the information sought will be specific information to assist with the preparation of criminal trials and inform the decision making of the prosecutor. This may include the following:

- to obtain information about the vulnerability of witnesses, to establish whether the use of special measures may be appropriate;
- to establish whether appropriate measures are now in place to protect a child, as part of the consideration as to whether it is in the public interest to prosecute an accused;
- to facilitate enquiries with expert witnesses on a particular line of evidence;

• to established whether there are any further lines of enquiry that should be pursued by the police;

Again, this list is not exhaustive. However, prosecutors must be aware of the rule against hearsay which would render statements by witnesses inadmissible.

24. Particular caution must be exercised in the request for any information about what was said at a Children's Hearing for the purposes of using it as evidence in a criminal prosecution. This includes any statement by a potential accused, which might otherwise be admissible as a statement against interest. As a general rule, it is not desirable that evidence of what was said at a Children's Hearing should be utilised in a criminal trial, unless there are exceptional circumstances. The same concerns arise in relation to an accused's acceptance of a statement of grounds prior to any proof proceedings. Any requests for such information should be submitted to Policy Division at Crown Office and thereafter Crown Counsel's Instructions will be obtained.

25. When the prosecutor requests any information, the reporter must consider why the information is being requested. This will include consideration of the factors referred to in paragraph 22 above. If the reporter considers that the implications for the Convention rights of the child or others, or the implications for engagement in the hearings process, are such that they outweigh the reasons why the information is sought, then the matter should be referred to the Crown Office Policy Division and/or the SCRA Head of Practice and Policy. However, unless there are exceptional circumstances, the information set out in paragraph 20 should normally be provided.

26. If the information sought is about a named individual, the material may be redacted by the reporter to remove details about a third party where the information about the third party is not relevant to the request by COPFS.

Requests from Defence

27. The Crown has a legislative duty to disclose to the defence all material information for or against an accused. This means the Crown must consider for disclosure *all* relevant information obtained in the course of an investigation and any criminal proceedings and ensure that all material information, namely information which:

(a) would materially weaken or undermine the evidence that is likely to be led by the prosecutor in the proceedings against the accused,

(b) would materially strengthen the accused's case, or

(c) is likely to form part of the evidence to be led by the prosecutor in the proceedings against the accused⁴

is disclosed to the defence.

⁴ Section 121(3) of the Criminal Justice and Licensing (Scotland) Act 2010

28. For disclosure purposes, 'information' means material of any kind **given to or obtained by the prosecutor** in connection with the proceedings. In appellate proceedings the definition of 'information' includes material given to or obtained by the prosecutor in connection with the appellate proceedings and the earlier proceedings to which the appellate proceedings relate. There may be situations where the accused believes that the reporter holds information, which they would wish to use for the purposes of preparing their defence. If the prosecutor already has this information, (whether through section 179 or otherwise), then the Crown's disclosure obligations must be considered in relation to that information. This will include a consideration of the materiality test, referred to above.

29. If the prosecutor is **not** in possession of this information, there should be an assessment as to whether or not the information requested is relevant and material. If the information is relevant and material and is held by SCRA, the prosecutor is to request it in terms of this protocol. If the information is not relevant and material there is no obligation on the prosecutor to obtain this from the reporter. A robust approach should be adopted by COPFS in relation to defence requests for information, to avoid inappropriate use of section 179. The correct procedure is for the defence to apply to the Court for an order granting commission and diligence or an order for the recovery of documents.

PROVISION OF INFORMATION FROM COPFS TO SCRA

30. Section 172 of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011 states:

Section 172

- (1) This section applies where an application is made to the sheriff-
- (a) to determine whether a section 67 ground is established, or
- (b) to review a grounds determination.

(2) The Principal Reporter may request a prosecutor to give the Principal Reporter evidence held by the prosecutor in connection with the investigation of a crime or suspected crime if the Principal Reporter considers that the evidence might assist the sheriff in determining the application.

(3) The request may relate only to evidence lawfully obtained in the course of the investigation.

(4) The prosecutor may refuse to comply with the request if the prosecutor reasonably believes that it is necessary to retain the evidence for the purposes of any proceedings in respect of a crime (whether or not the proceedings have already commenced)

When does section 172 apply?

31. Section 172(1) provides that where an application has been made to the sheriff by the Principal Reporter under section 67 of the Act ("proof proceedings"), or an application has been made to review any grounds determination under section 110 of the Act (a "section 110 application"), the Principal Reporter may request any prosecutor to supply him with evidence held by him. Section 172 does not, therefore, apply at the investigative stage of proceedings by the reporter. Section 63 of the Act also states that the Lord Advocate may direct the prosecutor to provide information to the Reporter, even when a request for information has not been made.

What does 'evidence' mean?

32. Section 172 refers to evidence lawfully obtained in the course of, and held by the prosecutor in connection with, the investigation of a crime or suspected crime. Evidence held by the police before a report has been submitted to the prosecutor is not covered by section 172. 'Evidence' in a general legal context means the testimony of witnesses, and documents and articles which go to proving alleged facts. The most common types of evidence likely to be the subject of section 172 requests are;

- medical and forensic science reports
- articles of clothing
- weapons
- plans and maps
- birth certificates

• recorded confessions

33. Where a statement is recorded in writing, DVD or on tape, these sources and oral evidence from the interviewer are equally primary evidence. In addition to the name of the relevant police officer, copies of taped police interviews with the accused will be made available by prosecutors to reporters, provided they contain relevant material e.g. incriminating statements, or details of a substantive defence. If the tape has been transcribed, a copy of the transcript will also be provided. Copies of witness statements taken by the police and copies of DVD recordings of joint investigative interviews of witnesses will not normally be supplied by the prosecutor, as these are routinely provided by the police directly to the reporter⁵. It will always be open to the reporter to cite the relevant witness to give oral evidence.

34. Evidence does <u>not</u> include precognitions which are confidentially held by the prosecutor and which are generally not admissible in criminal proceedings. It has been agreed, however, that copy precognitions of child victims will normally be made available on a confidential basis. It must be stressed that **no attempt should be made by reporters to lodge precognitions as productions in proceedings before the sheriff.** Although proof proceedings and a section 110 application come within the meaning of civil proceedings for the purposes of the Civil Evidence (Scotland) Act 1988, the definition of a statement **does not** extend to a statement in precognition form and, accordingly, precognitions are not admissible as hearsay evidence in the proceedings in terms of Part 10 of the above act.

Are there any qualifications as to the nature of the evidence which can be supplied?

35. The evidence must be evidence which might assist the sheriff in determining an application to determine whether a section 67 is established or to review a ground. It will be for the reporter to make that preliminary assessment. Prosecutors should also have regard to this test when considering requests. The fact that a reporter has not requested a specific piece of evidence (of which he may have no knowledge) should not prevent a prosecutor alerting the reporter to the existence of evidence which may, in his judgement, assist the sheriff in proceedings under the 2011 Act.

36. The request by the reporter must be made in writing and must confirm that an application has been made to the sheriff. To ensure that all relevant factors are covered, a style request is attached at Annex B. This will also be used as a receipt and will specify the date by which the items must be returned.

⁵ In relation to the joint investigative interviews of children see the Scottish Government's "<u>Guidance on Joint Investigative Interviewing of Child Witnesses in Scotland</u>".

How should the prosecutor deal with a request under section 172?

37. The prosecutor should comply with such a request **unless** he reasonably believes that it is necessary to retain the evidence for the purposes of any proceedings in respect of a crime. Proceedings need not have been commenced to justify refusal, but a decision should have been made to proceed. It will be reasonable for the prosecutor to retain evidence where:

- a trial is due to commence imminently
- evidence requires to be forensically or otherwise examined, analysed or inspected
- evidence is required for precognition purposes
- releasing it would create a risk to the public, or to the security or integrity of the evidence
- releasing it would prejudice the accused's right to inspect the evidence (section 68 of the Criminal Procedure (Scotland) Act 1995)
- the accused is to examine the productions as part of the Crown's disclosure obligations

This list is not exhaustive.

38. In most situations, proof proceedings will take place prior to a criminal trial in relation to the same subject matter. Evidence should not be withheld by the prosecutor purely to prevent this from occurring.

39. In most proof proceedings and section 110 applications, a copy of the evidence or a photograph will be sufficient for the reporter's purposes. If the reporter only requests a copy or a photograph of the evidence, the prosecutor must provide the copy or the photograph.

What happens when the evidence is returned to the prosecutor?

40. The prosecutor should acknowledge receipt of the evidence. If the items handed over have been altered in any way, the reporter must bring this to the attention of the prosecutor, explain how it occurred and give details of any relevant witnesses.

What happens in cases which fall outwith the terms of section 172?

Before the case has been reported to the prosecutor

41. Where evidence is being held by the police in connection with the investigation of a crime which has not yet been reported to the prosecutor, any request for access to such evidence should be intimated to the police **and** the prosecutor. The police should then provide the prosecutor with an interim report containing such information about the investigation and the evidence as will enable the prosecutor to decide whether section 172 is likely to apply in the future, and what should be done with the request in the interim. If the police are likely to report the matter to the prosecutor procedures similar to

those detailed above in paragraphs 31-40 should be applied. Where proceedings are not likely, the prosecutor can authorise the police to deliver the productions to the reporter. However, this paragraph will not apply where copies or photographs of the evidence will be sufficient for the reporter's purposes. In these situations the reporter should request the copies and/or photographs from the police without intimating the request to the prosecutor.

Before an application has been made to the sheriff

42. Request for evidence by the reporter before an application to the sheriff (i.e. at the investigative stage of proceedings by the reporter) should be dealt with on a case by case basis by the local prosecutor. In most situations it should be sufficient for the reporter to have access to the evidence at the Procurator Fiscal's Office, without it being physically handed to them. However, this paragraph will not apply where copies or photographs of the evidence will be sufficient for the reporter's purposes. In these situations the reporter should request the copies and/or photographs from the police without contacting the prosecutor.

<u>'No Criminal Court Proceedings'</u>

43. A request for access to evidence in cases that have been marked by the prosecutor for a non-court disposal should be made to the prosecutor to enable the prosecutor to issue the necessary authorisation to the police. lt should be borne in mind that the police may dispose of evidence, or return it to its owner, upon the non-court decision being made by the prosecutor. Any request for productions would require to be made before they are disposed of or returned. Police should be aware of the reporter's interest in the case and should not dispose of evidence in such cases until the reporter's proceedings are at an end or the reporter has decided to take no proceedings. Evidence will be retained where cases are marked 'no action meantime', a common marking in uncorroborated child abuse cases. However, this paragraph will not apply where copies or photographs of the evidence will be sufficient for the reporter's purposes. In these situations the reporter should request the copies and/or photographs from the police without contacting the prosecutor.

Evidence lodged with the Sheriff Clerk or Clerk of Justiciary

44. Requests for evidence which have been lodged with the court by the prosecutor in anticipation of a trial are unlikely to be granted. However, if access to the evidence is considered essential, the matter should be discussed with the prosecutor in order that consideration may be given to an application to the court for temporary release of the evidence. Where the trial has been concluded and the productions are still held by the Court, requests should be made to the relevant clerk of court.

Confidentiality

45. Reporters must respect the confidentiality of the items handed over and comply with the conditions set out in Annex B. Nothing should be done

to alter, contaminate or damage the evidence. Reporters must retain the evidence securely until it is lodged in court.

46. Evidence borrowed by the reporter in terms of this protocol is given to him in confidence. The reporter is likely to exhibit it to other parties in the proceedings and may exhibit it to any expert instructed by the reporter or the other parties. However, the reporter will retain the evidence in his possession apart from when it is lodged in court and will ensure that there is no tampering or interfering with it. Any other requests for access to the productions should be referred to the prosecutor.

47. In terms of their disclosure requirements, the reporter may be required to disclose the evidence to other parties, either by providing a copy of the evidence or exhibiting it. Whether or not such evidence is disclosed will normally be a matter for the reporter. However, in exceptional circumstances (for example, where there is the possibility that disclosure may prejudice an ongoing investigation or prosecution), the prosecutor may indicate to the reporter (either directly or through the police) that any decision on whether or not to disclose evidence to other parties must be referred to the prosecutor.

Crown Office

Scottish Children's Reporter Administration

2014

ANNEX A

PRO FORMA REQUEST FROM COPFS FOR INFORMATION FROM SCRA

DATE:

Name of Procurator Fiscal:	Name of Reporter:
Address:	Address:
Tel No:	Tel No:
Email address:	Email address:

Name of Accused:	Date of Birth (dd/mm/yyyy)	
Police Ref. No.	PF Ref. No.	
Date criminal proceedings commenced:	Stage of criminal proceedings:	
List of charges:	Forum (Summary, Sheriff & Jury or High Court)	

Name of Child (if different from accused):		Date of birth (if different from accused)	Address (if different from accused):
Child's connection to the criminal proceedings:	Accused	Witness	Other (please specify):-

Information/documentation sought:		
Reason(s) why the above is being sought: (including reference to how it will assist in the prevention or detection of crime or the apprehension or prosecution of offenders, and why it is necessary in the public interest): Date approval from Crown Counsel obtained:		
Are there implications for the rights of the child or others under the ECHR?	No Article 2 right to life Article 3 prohibition of torture/degrading treatment Article 4 prohibition of slavery/servitude Article 5 right to liberty and security of person Article 6 right to fair and public hearing Article 7 no punishment without law Article 8 right to private and family life Article 9 right to freedom of thought/conscience/religion Article 10 right to freedom of expression Article 11 right to freedom of peaceful assembly/association Article 12 right to marry and found a family Article 13 right to remedy upon violation of rights Article 14 right to enjoyment of rights without discrimination	
Please explain the implications even if the "No" box is ticked:		

ANNEX B

PRO FORMA REQUEST FROM SCRA FOR THE PROVISION OF EVIDENCE FROM COPFS

DATE:

Name of Reporter:	Name of Procurator Fiscal:	
Address:	Address:	
Tel No:	Tel No:	
Email address:	Email address:	

Name of Child :	Date of birth:	CMS ref no:	

Name of Accused:	Date of Birth (dd/mm/yyyy)	
Police Ref. No.	PF Ref. No.	

Date of proof application:	Sheriff Court:	
Date proof commences (or date of next calling if no date for proof set):	Estimated duration (if no date for proof has been set, include estimate of proof start date):	

Brief summary of the statement of grounds:	
Details of evidence requested:	
Reasons why the evidence is required:	

I hereby **agree** to release the above items to the Reporter on condition

(i)that the evidence is returned to me by or earlier if so requested⁶.
(ii) any other specific condition specified by the prosecutor

(Signed): Procurator Fiscal

The Procurator Fiscal is **unable to comply** with the above request and the above items are unable to be released to the Reporter on the basis that it is necessary to retain the evidence for the purposes of proceedings (which may have commenced or may be in contemplation).

If any court dates have been assigned, please include them below:

(Signed): Procurator Fiscal

TO BE GIVEN / SENT TO PROCURATOR FISCAL UPON RECEIPT OF ITEMS

I acknowledge receipt of the undernoted items and I undertake to keep them secure and return the items to the Procurator Fiscal on the above date or earlier if so requested.	
1.	
2.	
3.	
Date:	(Signed): Reporter

TO BE GIVEN / SENT TO REPORTER UPON RECEIPT OF RETURNED OF ITEMS

I acknowledge return of the	undernoted items:
1.	
2.	
3.	
Date:	(Signed): Procurator Fiscal

⁶ This statement and the undernoted acknowledgements of receipt may be communicated by e-mail as an alternative to transmitting a hard copy of this form.